

The Use of Integral Citations in Master's Degree Theses

Nor Azma Manan

*Kolej Komuniti Temerloh, By Pass Batu 2, Jalan Temerloh, Kg Chatin Ulu, 28400 Mentakab,
Pahang Darul Makmur, Malaysia.*

Email: gemthreeofive@yahoo.com

Tel: +60127059735

Noorizah Mohd Noor

Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, 43600 Bangi, Selangor Darul Ehsan, Malaysia.

Email: nmn@ukm.edu.my

Tel: +60193071619

ABSTRACT

The aim of this study was to analyze the integral citations in Master's degree thesis in Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM). Six theses were selected based on purposive sampling. Data analysis was conducted using Thompson & Tribble's (2001) framework for integral citations. For integral citation, analysis revealed that verb controlling has the highest occurrences (n=198), followed by naming (n=48) and non- citation (n=2). There were also two new categories discovered by the researcher which are double citation; a sentence that refers to primary and secondary sources of citation; and combination category; the integral and non- integral citations which are combined in a sentence. The implication of this study is to have a training course on Research Methodology to enhance the students' skills on the important elements in doing research, particularly the use of integral citation in academic writing.

Keywords: integral citations; postgraduate students; academic writing.

1.0 INTRODUCTION

Academic writing is defined as producing academic essays or compositions that satisfy the necessity of a school or college in the target language (Tarnopolsky & Kozhushko, 2007). There are many kinds of academic writing including writing assignments, project papers, research articles, theses, and so forth. Academic writing is different as compared to other general writing due to the specific writing conventions and particular structures that it has. According to Bowker (2007), there are four differences between research writing and general writing. Firstly, it concerns with the structure of the content, where it has the introduction of the study, literature review, methodology, discussion of findings, and summary of the study. Secondly, citations need to be included to support the claims made and to show that the writer is able to relate the current study with previous studies. Thirdly, they need to have 'grammar concern' and ensure that the writing has been carefully edited before submission. Finally, the writer needs to describe the point clearly by giving examples and elaboration to reflect their intellectual level. The differences of skills stated above are very important for students to produce a coherent piece of writing.

One of the characteristics that distinguish research writing and general writing is the use of citations in supporting the claims made. Citations are divided into two types, which are integral citations and non-integral citations. Generally, integral citations contain the author's name in the statement written by the researcher where in this citation, the researcher tends to draw attention to the author, while for non-integral citations, the researcher stresses more on the product and reduces the visibility of the author (Soler- Monreal & Gil- Salom, 2011). However, this paper will only focus on integral citations in Master's degree theses of English Language Studies (ELS) in Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM).

2.0 LITERATURE REVIEW

Integral citations are divided into three which are verb controlling, naming, and non-citation (Thompson & Tribble, 2001). The first sub-category of integral citation is verb controlling. This citation acts as the agent to control the verb, whether in active or passive voice. For instance,

Bland (2003) also explained that men are aggressive in physical and verbal situations, competitive and are born as challengers.

The example is in active voice, where the writer emphasized that Bland (2003), who is the researcher had elaborated on men's nature. The placement of the researcher's name at the beginning of the sentence signifies that the researcher is given the authority to control the rest of the sentence.

The second sub-category of integral citation is naming. There are several uses for this category. One of the uses is demonstrated in the example below:

A study on language use by female Malaysian bloggers was carried out by Akhmaliah (2009)

The citation in this sub-category is a noun phrase or a part of a noun phrase. The distinction is grammatical, but the form also implies reification, such as when the noun phrase, which is *A study*, *female Malaysian bloggers*, and *Akhmaliah* indicates a text, rather than a human agent. In naming, the focus is given to the activity rather than the researcher.

Another example of reification is when the naming citation identifies a particular equation, method, formulation or similar construct with individual researchers. It can be seen in the example below:

A television clip was analysed and the methodological approach selected is CDA, in particular the three dimensional model developed by Fairclough (1995).

In this example, the writer stressed on the methods and the model used in the study, which were designed by Fairclough (1995). This example also shows that the ownership of the ideas belongs to Fairclough (1995).

An alternative type of naming citation is that which refers generally to the work or findings of a particular researcher:

A study conducted by Hoepfner (2006) discusses the various intentions and techniques of consumer product companies in reaching more customers and selling more products.

In this case, the placement of 'study' at the beginning of the sentence implies that the writer has focused on the research performed by Hoepfner (2006) and the content of the research.

The second sub-category of integral citations is non-citation. In this sub-category, there is a reference to another writer but the name is given without a year reference. It is most commonly used when the reference has been supplied earlier in the text and the writer does not want to repeat it. For instance,

Messaries states that there are basically three functions of visual images.

However, there is a restriction in using this form of citation. Some academic communities do not approve the use of non-citation as it is considered to be 'not academic enough'. This is because

there is no year reference stated, even though it has been supplied earlier in the text. Non-citations have to be used carefully depending on the writer's knowledge and the context in which they refer to.

Studies done by several researchers have shown that citation is the core of research writing. For example, Mohammad Hossein Helali Oskueia and Kuhl (2014) concentrated on citation patterns among Iranian and English MA theses. Meanwhile, a local researcher, Nik Mastura Nik Ismail Azlan (2013) had analyzed six master's degree dissertations by TESL and Visual Art Education graduate students from the Faculty of Education, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Shah Alam. This study also analyzed the density of citations in each of the sections in the theses. It revealed that the literature review section has the highest density of citations as compared to other sections in the theses. As stated in ED720 M.Ed TESL Student Handbook (2008, p.25), literature review "requires a substantial amount of current and past literature documented on relevant issues." Thus, it is undeniable that literature review section contains more references from previous researchers in order to support one's research topic.

From the review of previous studies on citation, it can be observed that there is a gap which has to be filled. Previous international study includes one that focused on the purpose of citation and the category in integral citation between Iranian and English writers. Meanwhile, local researchers have focused on citation patterns in discussion texts produced by TESL and Visual Art Education undergraduates. However, none of the theses has analysed the citation pattern among postgraduates from the ELS program in Malaysia. This is the gap that needs to be filled thus the current study aims to analyze the category of integral citation that is mostly used by master's degree students from the ELS program in UKM and to gain some insights on how local master's degree students in the ELS program write their theses.

3.0 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

For integral citation, several studies have been conducted on the problem with lack of vocabulary faced by second language writers (L2) in producing academic writing. A similar concern was raised by Okamura (2008) and Harwood (2010) who stressed that second language writers (L2) have more difficulty in the use of citation forms to construct a persuasive argument than first language (L1) writers due to language barrier and limited vocabulary.

Besides having lack of vocabulary in producing academic writing, L2 writers also lack of knowledge in using citations properly. This problem was identified by Shoostari and Jalilifar (2010), and Harwood (2010) who emphasized that non-native English students are always uncertain about the appropriate way in citing previous researchers due to a variety of ways in citing across different disciplines. They are also unaware of the functions of citations in academic writing which is believed to be due to the influence by certain social and cultural practices.

The third concern related to this study has been illustrated by Mohammad Hossein Helali Oskueia and Kuhl (2014). In their study, emphasis was given on the problem faced by local writers who lack knowledge and language repertoire in using citations in their academic writing. The study concludes that novice writers tend to use citations to support their statements rather than commenting on or evaluating what they have quoted. Thus, they could not achieve what is expected of master's degree students which is to apply higher level thinking as suggested in Blooms' Taxonomy, such as evaluating and making judgment towards previous research studies.

Besides issues raised by international research studies, local studies have also raised the identical issue of integral citation. Zainab and Goi (1997), Loi (2012), Mah and Ting (2012) and Nik Mastura Nik Ismail Azlan (2013) found out that novice writers are incompetent in producing persuasive arguments due to their lack of exposure towards the essential element in research writing and also

the writer's language background. These are some of the problems in integral citation that are closely related to the current study.

To relate with this study, one can notice some common problems faced by novice writers, particularly university students such as their lack of knowledge and experience in writing convincing texts. Students are unable to use important elements in research writing, especially integral citation persuasively and appropriately. They are also unable to choose which integral citations are most suitable for particular contexts, thus inhibiting their intention to convey strong claims. Their inability to elaborate on the cited text and to comment aggravates their situation. Although the contexts of international and local studies are different, there are hardly any differences in their findings related to the possible reason for students' way of constructing arguments.

One of the problems related to citation is students' difficulty in citing the work appropriately where they have placed the citation and the explanation/statement in two different paragraphs. This problem concerns with the inappropriate technique of citation. The student has just directly lifted the sentences from previous researchers and put it in separate paragraphs with the name of the author at the bottom of the written statement. This situation may affect the persuasiveness of their claims. By having a proper indication with the earlier statement and the citation, the link between the previous statement, the citation, and the preceding statement can be clearly seen. It can also prevent confusion among readers on what the writer is trying to say.

The second problem of integral citation is related with the inability to link the previous statement with the cited statements. This problem concerns with the inability of the student to show the connection between earlier claims within the citation itself. The student has put the citation in an inappropriate place which caused incongruence in terms of the sentence itself. When it is read, the sentence and the citation do not make sense at all. This has somewhat shown that the student had not thought properly about the relationship between his/her own statement with the citation chosen. It also reveals the student's lack of knowledge about the impact of citations used towards their writing.

The third problem concerns the inappropriate technique of citation. The student has simply taken the statement from previous researchers and put it in a separate paragraph. This shows that the paragraph is solely for the citation alone without any explanation or other supported statements. This condition has somewhat affected the reader's view towards the quality and the credibility of writing among master's degree students from the ELS program in UKM.

The fourth problem with citation lies in the inability of the master's degree students in showing an appropriate level of intellectual development. It proves that the student has not shown the appropriate cognitive skill that a master's degree student ought to have. It is not wrong to take a statement directly from its original source but one has to simplify or summarize the idea or synthesize the point and not just simply to cite previous researchers, hoping that the citation is well-explained. At master's degree level, readers have higher expectation of postgraduates' writing ability. Thus, the citation has to be supported with the writer's own statement, judgment or comments towards the statement to differentiate between undergraduate writing and postgraduate writing.

4.0 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

In conducting this study, two main objectives are listed, which are to:

- 1) investigate the category of integral citation that is commonly employed in the Master's ELS students' theses

- 2) outline the pedagogical considerations that can be recommended on the use of integral citation

5.0 METHODOLOGY

5.1 RESEARCH DESIGN

This is a qualitative study where it requires a broad collection from a natural setting without the intervention of the researcher over a period of time (Gay, 1996). To enhance the qualitative study, a “multimethod” research design was employed to conduct this study (Gay, 1996, p.14). The various methods included observation and analysis of the theses collected in order to gain more understanding and insights into the situation. This study also employed a corpus-based discourse analysis to analyse the integral citation among Master’s Degree theses of UKM postgraduates. The research design is suitable for this study as the researcher has to analyse specific linguistic features in a few sets of corpus (theses) and citation. It also enables the researcher to generalize the description of the discourse structure (Biber et al, 2007) to better understand the context.

5.2 CORPUS SELECTION

In this study, only literature review section of six theses produced by the ELS students in MA program in UKM were chosen. The fact that the researcher chose the literature review section is because integral citations are mostly found in that section (Soler- Monreal & Gil- Salom, 2011, Ghaleb Rabab’ah & Ahmed Al- Marshadi, 2013). It is also lack of local study that focuses on Malaysian students’ citation practices except the study done by Zainab and Goi (1997), Loi (2012), and Mah and Ting (2012). The average length of the literature review section was about 26 pages each, which made up a total of 156 pages (approximately 70,200 words) of literature review section to be looked into. The decision to analyse the number of theses was made after considering the number of document analysed by previous researchers who studied citation. For instance, Jalilifar & Dabbi (2012) analysed 8 PhD theses (introduction section), Ghaleb Rabab’ah & Ahmed Al-Marshadi (2013) analysed 10 EFL Master’s theses (the whole section of the theses), and Charles (2006) analysed 8 theses (the whole section of the theses). Hence, six MA theses are considered sufficient for this study.

In selecting the theses, several criteria were adhered to. First, permission was obtained from the Chairperson of School of Language and Linguistic. Then, the theses written by ELS students in MA program were determined by name and were written in 2012, with the ELS program written on the cover of their thesis. Third, the theses must be empirical in nature, not related with the literary analysis, and use English as a medium of interaction. The theses were randomly selected, which were three theses from Semester 1 and three theses from Semester 2 in session 2012/13. The selection of the theses was done by using purposive sampling. The theses were obtained from the Resource Centre at School of Language Studies and Linguistics, UKM. All six theses had already been evaluated and graded by the writers’ supervisors before they were allowed for submission and approved for binding.

5.3 INSTRUMENT FOR CORPUS ANALYSIS

To analyse the data, the researcher used a set of checklist in examining the citation practices in the six UKM ELS Master’s Degree theses. A checklist was deemed to be the most suitable instrument in this study as it is able to guide the researcher on the important aspects or

characteristics that should be focused on (Gay, 1996). The checklist used to identify the citation was adopted from Thompson and Tribble (2001). (**Refer Appendix A**)

5.4 PROCEDURE OF CORPUS ANALYSIS

First, the researcher identified the types of documents that would be involved in this study. After deciding that the documents to be analysed would be theses, the researcher then chose the year the theses were produced and the program the theses were related to as well as the place where those theses could be obtained. Three theses from Semester 1 and three theses from Semester 2 were selected based on purposive sampling by referring to the local Malaysian names of the writers, regardless of their gender, race and religion. The writers are from the ELS Program in 2012. Permission was sought from the Chairperson of the School of Language and Linguistic Studies and the Resource Centre. Once permission was given, the researcher then looked for the theses at the Resource Centre and examined the Literature Review section for accuracy and completeness, and whether it concurred with the objectives of the study. If it did, a photograph of the cover of each thesis would be taken as well as the whole content of the Literature Review section. In doing so, the researcher is able to keep a record of which Literature Review section belongs to which thesis. This data collection process of the six theses took about two days to complete.

Next, the researcher scanned all the photos taken and printed them out. Every Literature Review section was marked with T1, T2, T3, T4, T5, and T6. The classification of integral citation namely verb controlling, naming and non-citation together with the characteristics were prepared beforehand. The researcher tried to analyse the first Literature Review section with the classification notes side by side. The researcher eventually categorized the sentences which could be classified easily and decided that the sentences which seemed vague or difficult to be classified, should be categorised at a later time. The process was done by highlighting the sentences with different colours and counting the frequency of occurrence (Soler-Monreal & Gil-Salom, 2011). After all the related sentences were recorded, the researcher checked and read all the sentences in every Literature Review section twice for confirmation and to avoid any error. This tedious process was conducted for the Literature Review section of three theses. When it came to the Literature Review section of the rest of the theses, the time taken was reduced as the researcher was already familiar with the pattern. All of the sentences recorded were marked in the checklist prepared earlier for easy reference.

6.0 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

6.1 CATEGORIES OF INTEGRAL CITATION USED BY MA ELS IN THEIR THESES

Table 1 illustrates the frequency of integral citations used in six theses studied:

TABLE 1. Frequency Of Integral Citations

<i>No of theses</i>	<i>Frequency of integral citations used (n)</i>
1	74
2	49
3	26
4	15
5	67
6	19
TOTAL	250

Integral citations have a total of 250 occurrences throughout the analysis in six theses. T1 prevails with the total of 74. This is followed by T5 with 67 integral citations and T2 with 49 occurrences. About one tenth of the total of integral citations can be found in T3. The least frequency of integral citations can be found in T6 with 19 occurrences and T4 with 15 occurrences. Hyland (2004, p.31) claimed that “the more frequent citations in the soft texts therefore suggest greater care in firmly situating research within disciplinary frameworks and supporting claims with intertextual warrants”. This statement is extremely apparent in T1 and T2 where both theses have the highest citations as compared to other theses. Making more attributions to previous research will show that the writer is trying carefully to put his or her research at the same level with the existing research. It can also enhance the reliability of the research as it is supported with solid statements from other researchers. This indirectly gives more ideas to the writer to write their own study thus making it more resourceful, valid, and impactful.

From Table 2, it is discovered that there is a big gap in the way the students write their Master’s thesis, where some theses have high frequency of integral citation, while other theses have low frequency. These distinctions are due to different “epistemological and social conventions” as different people referred to variety, different sources in producing the theses thus influencing the way they write and structure their theses (Hyland 1999, p.341). This situation may concern with the intention of the writer, whether to stress the author or the information itself, to have a mixture of writing style, and depends on the familiarity of the students (Akiko 2007).

6.2 FREQUENCY OF EVERY CATEGORIES IN INTEGRAL CITATION

The following table presents the categories of integral citation used by MA ELS in their theses:

TABLE 2. Frequency Of Every Categories In Integral Citations

THESES	INTEGRAL					FREQUENCY
	Verb controlling	Naming	Non- citation	Double	Combination	
1	32	38	2	1	1	74
2	48	1	-	-	-	49
3	26	0	-	-	-	26
4	15	0	-	-	-	15
5	61	6	-	-	-	67
6	16	3	-	-	-	19
TOTAL	198	48	2	1	1	250

Table 2 shows that a total of 250 integral citations have been used in six theses. Verb controlling (see 2.6) has the largest number as compared to the other two categories, which are naming and non-citation. The biggest total of verb controlling can be found in T5 (n=61), followed by T2 (n=48) and T1 (n=32). Nearly one third of verb controlling can be discovered in T3 (n=26), while only a quarter of verb controlling are observed in T6 (n=16) and T4 (n=15).

There are several observations that can be seen from the analysis. Below are the examples of verb controlling used in the theses:

According to Danesi (2007:11) semiotics can be defined as “science of meaning”... (T1)

Bland (2003) also explained that men are aggressive...(T2)

West and Zimmerman (1983) define interruption...(T4)

These examples show that verb controlling is used as it is the basic way to cite the previous researchers. This explanation is supported by Mohammad Hossein Helali Oskueia and Kuhi (2014) who mentioned that writers prefer to use verb controlling in their writing probably because it is the most basic and easiest way to cite the work of previous researchers. Putting the author before the information will clearly show the references made by the writer. It also enhances the reader's understanding towards the statements made.

The second observation that can be drawn upon is that the writer associates the previous findings with current study. The example of the sentence is as below:

According to Barcelos (2000, p. 65), this approach employs questionnaire as an instrument for data collection and beliefs in language learning are seen as synonymous with preconceived notions, misconceptions and opinions. The advantages of this approach are that it allows the researcher to investigate beliefs with large samples and at different slots. However, the disadvantage of this method is that it restricts respondents' choices with a set of predetermined statements that will be different from students' interpretation. (T6)

These sentences uncover how the writer makes regular references to individual studies and contrasts their discoveries with his own discoveries (Shoostari & Jalilifar, 2010). In this case, the writer provides few statements from previous research and makes a connection with each of the information stated. This is one of the functions of verb controlling in which the writer uses it to link one idea with another besides adding the writer's own views towards the topic discussed.

Next, the writer uses verb controlling more frequently than other categories is most likely to support the claims made. The examples are shown below:

Numerous studies have shown that readers who are more aware of their metacognition become more proficient readers...This is further supported by Singhal (2001) who says that readers who use metacognitive strategies tend to be better readers. (T4)

In this case, verb controlling functioned as "the agent to control the verb" (Shoostari & Jalilifar, 2010, p.5) to support the information given in the study and acknowledging the previous researcher's works as well as to avoid plagiarism. It is known that every claim made needs to be supported with the concrete statement, thus, for this purpose, verb controlling plays an important role to reinforce the information.

Next, verb controlling can be expressed by using passive voice; however, active voice is preferred by ELS Master students in UKM. The examples of such usage are demonstrated below:

Meanwhile, Gaudart (1987) is of the view that today, the acquisition of English is seen as a necessary evil... (T3)

Brown (1990) described reading processes as... (T5)

The assumption that can be made is that the students are more familiar with active voice in reporting the information, which is by emphasizing the author as the doer, rather than the information itself (Mohammad Hossein Helali Oskueia & Kuhi, 2014). By this means, the explanation is clearer and more vivid in writing a thesis. Other than that, the active voice is more understandable and readable as compared to passive voice. This is supported by McCaskill (1998) where “writing authorities overwhelmingly prefer active voice because it is direct, clear, and natural. Overuse of passive voice weakens style and obscures responsibility” (p. 9). This statement explains the importance and the preference of using the active voice in constructing the sentences.

The high number of verb controlling employed by ELS Master students as proven in T5, and T2 clearly showed that they give the priority to the authors by stressing their names followed by the information. The examples are as follow:

Meanwhile, in Street et al. (2004), the postmodernist definition of literacy integrates skills in reading and writing to those of listening, communication and even thinking. (T5)

According to Rosseti (1998), in her gender research using email, she found that men were more interested in presenting their personal point of view ... (T2)

Based on the examples above, the name of the authors which is written before the information signifies that the author is the agent/ the one who controls the reporting verb used and the information that is to be told.

This finding is also in line with Jalilifar and Dabbi (2012) where verb controlling comprised of 64.8% and it is emphasized by the Iranian students, as compared to other types of integral citation. They mentioned that verb controlling is “the easiest and most obvious ways of incorporating citations into text” (p. 99). On the other hand, Shoostari and Jalilifar (2010) also revealed that verb controlling constitutes the highest frequency and percentage (n=30; 17%). Thus, it is undeniable that the same situation was noted in the six theses studied by the researcher.

On the other hand, T1 has extremely stated the highest number of naming (n=38). Almost one fifth of T5 used naming (n=6) followed by T6 (n=3) and T2 (n=1). None of these two theses, which are T3 and T4 applied naming in their writing. The examples of naming are as follow:

...semiotics is simply defined by Chandler (2007:1) as “the study of signs”. (T1)

The usage of first person pronoun ‘I’ was studied in speech by Holmes (1990) (T2)

Based on the examples above, it shows that the use of naming informs the readers that the reference is associated with a specific author. In this case, the writers tried to indicate that the information was belong to the author by using passive voice.

In other situation, Shoostari and Jalilifar (2010) claims that local writers tend to use naming to show performance oriented, which is focusing more on the information. T1 is the example of thesis that has the highest frequency of naming:

Apart from the definition given by Chandler (2007), there is another meaning of semiotics which is offered by Jakobson (1968). (T1)

Studies done about semiotics by Danesi (2007), Chandler (2007) and Jakobson (1968) will assist the researcher to answer the research questions and to justify the research findings later in Part IV. (T1)

Overall, the examples above demonstrate that T1 is the most balanced thesis as it has almost the equal amount of verb controlling and naming. This shows that the writer has applied various ways to cite the previous research to make the study more interesting and it shows the writer’s level of intellectual development (Hyland, 1999). It focused on both orientations, which are the person oriented, where it gives priority to the author and performance oriented that stresses the information rather than the author. T2, T3, T4, T5, and T6 have the least frequency of naming and most probably because of the difficulty level of this type of citation. Mohammad Hossein Helali Oskueia and Kuhi (2014) claimed that naming demands skillful writers to restructure the sentences and cite the information accurately. The second reason is it may be related to the culture of academic writing itself, where local writers tend to focus more on the person, rather than the work produced (Shoostari and Jalilifar, 2010). Meanwhile, the third possibility is they are not used to such kind of citation and also lack of exposure to this type of citation (Shoostari and Jalilifar, 2010; Mohammad Hossein Helali Oskueia and Kuhi, 2014). Thus, it contributes to the high frequency of verb controlling rather than naming in those theses mentioned above.

Amazingly, only T1 used non-citation in the writing (n=2) and it appears to be absent in the other theses studied. This is evident in the following examples:

T1: Example (a)

*In order to get the meaning of the symbols or the signs in the public signage, the concept of 'reading images', as aligned by **Kriss and Leeuwen (1996:6)** can be used as the guideline*

...

*According to **Kriss and Leeuwen**, children for instance, cannot express meaning freely because they have limited knowledge about it.*

Example (b)

*The term perspective has been defined by **Moran (2001)** as ...*

*As in **Moran's** work on language and culture, there are few attempts by ...*

*Based on **Moran's** dimension of culture...*

Examples (a) and (b) explains that the writer mentions the name of the researcher together with the publication year of the research for first appearance and eliminates the year for the preceding same researcher. This situation happened probably because the writer would like to avoid the confusion among the readers as there will be no repetition of year reference for the same author (Shoostari & Jalilifar 2010). The other possible reason for this condition is that this student may have referred to wider resources, especially international references (Rabab'ah 2005).

Hence, T1 has a variety of citations as compared to other theses. This finding is supported by Jalilifar and Dabbi (2012) who found out that only one eighth of the Iranian theses studied applied non citation in their writing. This finding is parallel with the current study where it proves that only minority of the writers use non- citation in their writing. However, the use of non- citation increases the authenticity of the text and makes the text sounds more natural (Shoostari & Jalilifar 2010).

Surprisingly, non-citation has the highest frequency of integral citation among the international writers in international theses (n=52; 40%) as compared to local theses (n=5, 7%). Nevertheless, Shoostari and Jalilifar (2010) added that certain academic societies refuse to accept non-citation and they regard it as unconventional because there is no year mentioned but only the name of the researcher even though the year is indicated in the earlier text. Therefore, it can be concluded that non-citation is only being used by a small group of people depending on the culture and the writer's own knowledge about its usage in a particular context.

Apart from that, there are also two new categories of citations found in T1 that the researcher is uncertain in terms of its grouping. The sample of the sentence is as below:

T1: Example (a)

*Emphatics used in advertisements that are seen through phrases such as **of course, pure and incredible** imply certainty and emphasize the force carried by the proposition. Intensifying adjectives are used to persuade consumers to purchase what is offered because the features are certain and necessary as the examples shown:*

***Great** looks are here to stay (Estee Lauder perfume)*

***Pure** moment of emotion (Hermes perfume)*

*The **big** chill (Cosmopolitan)*

(Cook, 2008, 344-355)

Example (b)

Some of the language expressions or phrased may be worded or may not be worded (especially in sections where headlines and slogans are included as shown below:

Cindy Crawford's choice (Omega Watch)

Double Wear (Estee Lauder make up)

(Cook, 2008:346)

In this case, the researcher is uncertain of which category the citation belongs to. It is difficult to determine if the sentences of *Great looks are here to stay*, *Pure moment of emotion*, *The big chill*, *Cindy Crawford's choice*, and *Double Wear* are cited from the product itself, which are Estee Lauder perfume, Hermes perfume, Cosmopolitan, Omega Watch, and Estee Lauder make up or from Cook (2008, p.344-355). However, based on the researcher's observation, the citation is taken from Cook (2008, p.344-355). Therefore, the researcher categorizes the citation as Double Citation, a new group, in which it is referring to two citations; one is taken from the product, which are the Estee Lauder perfume, Hermes perfume, Cosmopolitan, Omega Watch, and Estee Lauder make up while the second citation is taken from the author of the primary source, which is Cook (2008, p.344-355).

Besides Double Citation, the researcher can also see a Combination pattern where the integral and non-integral citations are combined in a sentence as shown in the example below:

As in Moran's work on language and culture, there are few attempts by Kramersch (1989), Fantini (1995), Agar (1994) and Byram and Morgan (1993) to merge the term language and culture such as linguaculture (Agar, 1994 in Moran, 2001: 35), and language-and culture (Byram and Morgan 1993-35). (T1)

These sentences show the complexity of citation for the researcher to categorize them according to their most appropriate group. Hence, the researcher proposes a new group of citation, which is called Combination that combines integral and non-integral citation in a sentence. The combination group is just to classify the macro group or simply said as the big category that the citation belongs to, which is the integral and non- integral citation and it does not classify the micro group, which are the sub categories such as *verb- controlling*, *naming*, and *non-citation* as in integral citation or *source*, *identification*, *reference* and *origin* as in non- integral citation. The rest of the theses do not show any problem in terms of citation and the researcher could easily categorize their group.

7.0 CONCLUSION

The findings of this study have some implications in teaching the students on how to use integral citation wisely in order to produce an impactful thesis. Some of the suggested considerations below are adapted from Thompson & Tribble (2001) and from the writer's point of view. The considerations include teaching the students more on how to summarize the points and paraphrase appropriately and try to avoid taking the points directly from the text. In some other way, it can help the students to improve their intellectual skill in citations to suit their level of study.

Second, students should be introduced with wider range of citations from various areas suitable with the level of their study, either in local or international text (Thompson & Tribble, 2001). This exposure is important as different areas use different way of citing the work of previous researchers. The distinction can also be seen in local and international text. Thus, the students can widen their view on citation, has wider resource on citation and thus able to put their work at the same level with international writings and gain the recognition from international community.

Third, learners should be given authentic texts for them to familiarize themselves with the types of citation, the usage and the purpose of the citation (Thompson & Tribble, 2001). This is because language should be used in context and not in isolation so that the students are easy to relate with the real world. From the sample texts given, the students will try to identify the citation used in the texts and categorize them. **(Refer Appendix B)**

After the exposures with the model texts, students should be left working with their peers (Thompson & Tribble, 2001). They should practice to produce their own writings, perhaps in few paragraphs and ask peers to check their friend's work. By this means, they are able to learn from

each other under the instructor's supervision in order to help them to better structure their theses and hence adding it to the existing information that they have had. In addition, it can also provide practical use for MA students in order to have the adequate knowledge on citation.

Finally, students should review their own writing and look for areas to improve (Thompson & Tribble, 2001). They can also refer and discuss with the instructor if they have any confusion related with citation. These processes are vital to equip the MA students to apply the citation appropriately in writing up their theses before they move to the higher level of study, such as PhD.

After all, these considerations are only parts of the ways to teach students, particularly MA students in citations. As everyone are well informed, citations are one of the crucial parts in academic writing where having the linguistic proficiency alone is inadequate and it has to be substantiated with the knowledge of citation as well. By knowing all the important elements in academic writing, it will help Master students and the novice researchers to produce clear, coherent, and effective theses.

REFERENCES

- Akiko, O. (2007). Writer's intention behind the citation forms in academic texts. *The Economic Journal of Takasaki City University of Economics*. 49(3), 57-70.
- Biber, D., Connor, U. & Upton, T. (2007). *Discourse on the move: Using corpus analysis to describe discourse structure*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Bowker, N. (2007). Academic Writing: A Guide to Tertiary Level Writing. Retrieved February 24, 2014 from <http://owll.massey.ac.nz/pdf/Academic-Writing-Guide.pdf>
- Charles, M. (2006). Phraseological patterns in reporting clauses used in citation: A corpus-based study of theses in two disciplines. *English for Specific Purposes*. 25, 310-331.
- Gay, L.R. (1996). *Educational research: competencies for analysis and application*. (5th ed.). New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Ghaleb Rabab'ah & Ahmed Al- Marshadi. (2013). Integrative vs Non- Integrative Citations among Native and Non-native English Writers. *International Education Studies*. 6(7), 78-87.
- Harwood, N. (2010). Research-based materials to demystify academic citation for postgraduates. In N. Harwood, (Ed.). *English Language Teaching Materials: Theory and Practice* (pp. 301-321). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Hyland, K. (1999). Academic Attribution : Citation and the Construction of Disciplinary Knowledge. *Applied Linguistics*. 20(3), 341-367.
- Hyland, K. (2004). *Disciplinary Discourses: Social Interactions in Academic Writing*. USA: University of Michigan.
- Jalilifar, A. & Dabbi, R. (2012). Citation in Allied Linguistic: Analysis of Introduction sections of Iranian Master's Theses. *Linguistik Online*. 57(7), 91-104.
- Loi, C.K. (2012). A Corpus Based Analysis: The use of citations. Paper presented at the International Conference Innovative Research in a Changing and Challenging World. Thailand: Phuket, May.
- Mah Sau Fong & Ting Su Hie. (2012). Learning to cite authority to develop arguments in academic discussions. Retrieved January 21, 2014 from <http://symposia.unimas.my/iii/cpro/DigitalItemViewPage.external?lang=eng&sp=1004125&sp=T&suite=def>

- McCaskill, M.K. (1998). *Grammar, Punctuation, and Capitalization: A Handbook for Technical Writers and Editors*. Virginia: Langley Research Center.
- Mohammad Hossein Helali Oskueia & Kuhi, D. (2014). The Use of Citations in Academic Writing: Analysis of Introduction Sections of Iranian and Native English Master's Theses. *Journal of Social Issues & Humanities*. 2(3), 216-220.
- Nik Mastura Nik Ismail Azlan. (2013). Citation Typologies and Rhetorical Functions of Citations in Master Dissertations. *Journal of Creative Practices in Language Learning and Teaching (CPLT)*. 1(2), 61-74.
- Okamura, A. (2008). Use of citation forms in academic texts by writers in the L1 & L2 context. *The Economic Journal of Takasaki City*. 51(1), 29-44.
- Rabab'ah, G. (2005). Communication problems facing Arab learners of English. *Journal of Language and Learning*. 3(1). 180-197.
- Shoostari, Z.G. & Jalilifar, A.R. (2010). Citation and the Construction of Subdisciplinary Knowledge. *The Journal of Teaching Language Skills*. 2(1), 45-66.
- Soler- Monreal, C. & Gil- Salom, L. (2011). A cross-language study on citation practice in PhD theses. *International Journal of English Studies*. 11(2), 53-75.
- Tarnopolsky, O., & Kozhushko, S. (2007). *Teaching academic writing in English to tertiary students in Ukraine*. International Online Conference on Second and Foreign Language Teaching and Research. Retrieved August 16, 2008 from http://www.readingmatrix.com/conference/pp/proceedings2007/tarnopolsky_kozhushko.pdf
- Thompson, P. & Tribble, C. (2001). Looking at Citations: Using Corpora in English for Academic Purposes. *Language Learning & Technology*. 5(3), 91-105.
- Universiti Teknologi MARA. (2008). *ED 720 M. Ed TESL Student Handbook*. Shah Alam: Universiti Teknologi MARA.
- Zainab Awang Ngah & Goi Sook Sze. (1997). Characteristics of Citations Used by Humanities Researchers. *Malaysia Journal of Library & Information Science*. 2(2), 19-36.

APPENDIX A

CHECKLIST OF CITATION

Identification no. of thesis	Integral		Frequency of Use (%)
	Verb controlling	Naming Non citation	
T1			
T2			
T3			
T4			
T5			
T6			
Sub-total			
	Grand total		

APPENDIX B

EXERCISE ON CATEGORIZATION OF THE CITATION

Example of the sentences	Category of citation/ Group of citation